TO Mr. Walter H. Breen
Post Office Box 352
Berkeley, Calif. 94701

FROM JOHN J. FORD, JR.
Numismatist
POST OFFICE BOX 33
ROCKVILLE CENTRE, N. Y. 11571
(516) BO 4-8988

SUBJECT: The 1711-16 Mexican gold "Royal Fifth" ingots DATE: April 22, 1974

HOLD MESSAGE

Dear Walter:

As you may have noticed, Prof. T. R. Buttrey (on the A.N.S. Council with E. P. Newman) recently attacked the aforementioned ingots. Buttrey gave a talk concerning them at the Sept. 1973 Int. Numismatic Congress (under A.N.S. auspices), and got short diatribes published in both "Coin World" and "World Coins." He claims that no copy of his talk (or presented paper) is available, and that he is preparing a "revised" draft. A typical hatchet job!

Two people were greatly upset by all this, many more less so. I am livid, and want to prepare a detailed answer to Buttrey once his attack is published someplace with specifics. Dr. Stefanelli, of the Smithsonian, is greatly embarrassed, as he has about a dozen of these ingots from the Lilly coll. I still own about 10 or 11 pieces. I have photos and data re an almost equal amount offered in a '72 British Glendining sale. I also have (don't ask me how) the guts of Buttrey's case, in writing. Lastly, I have detailed dope re the "fineness" and "weight" stampings on these ingots (which Buttrey, in his talk, claimed were non-existent). I need your help in analyzing the facts, and in checking out the Smithsonian pieces.

Stanley Apfelbaum is in agreement with all this, and suggested that I so advise you. I spoke to Dr. Stefanelli about it, and arrangements can be made to have you work at the Smithsonian on a Saturday. Details have to be worked out such as the conflict with your F.C.I. duties, but these should prove to be no problem. I would need to see you for a couple of hours before you leave for Washington. Hurriedly-

PLEASE REPLY TO ——→ SIGNED

REPLY

cc: Herb Melnick

DATE SIGNED

PRINTED BY GRAYARC CO., INC., BROOKLYN, N. Y. 11232

THE AMERICAN NUMISMATIC SOCIETY
announces the presentation of
THE ARCHER M. HUNTINGTON MEDAL AWARD
to

T. V. Buttrey

Emeritus Professor of Classical Studies, The University of Michigan
Emeritus Keeper of Coins, Fitzwilliam Museum, Cambridge University

Saturday, March 16, 1996
3:00 P.M.

Following the presentation, Prof. Buttrey will deliver
an illustrated address

"Western American Gold Bars"

A reception will follow.

Members and their guests are invited to join Prof. Buttrey for dinner at Girafe, 208 East 58th Street, at 6:30 PM. Reservations must be made in advance and cost $50 per person. Please send your payment directly to the Society for reservations, enclosing your phone number for confirmation.

The American Numismatic Society
Broadway at 155th Street
New York, NY 10032
(212) 234-3130

ERIC P. NEWMAN NUMISMATIC EDUCATION SOCIETY

6250 Cecil Avenue, St. Louis, Missouri 63105

Prof. Peter Gaspar
Department of Chemistry
Washington University
St. Louis, MO 63130

July 3, 2000

Dear Peter:

You have asked us for a copy of the unfinished opinion of Walter Breen as to the Mexican gold ingots in connection with working up data and possibly comments on the Buttrey-Hodder matter. This request follows your reading of the Hodder material just published by ANS in the American Journal of Numismatics, 2nd, Vol. XI. During the long numismatic association with you we have never denied any request from you for available data unless it is specifically confidential or restricted in our possession. Accordingly we are furnishing you with the following:

1. Photocopy of "Preliminary Report" by Breen on Mexican gold ingots. The handwritten portions are in Breen's hand and in purple ink in the original.
2. Photocopy of letter dated April 9, (apparently 1974) from Walter Breen to Stanley Applebaum relating to the Mexican gold ingot matter. This letter was quoted from and offered for sale in a George Kolbe auction a year or so ago.

You have previously furnished us with a copy of a letter dated April 22, 1974 from John Ford to Walter Breen relating to the Mexican gold ingot matter. It mentions Stanley Applebaum of First Coin Investors where Breen was employed as a vice president and Herb Melnick was connected in some way.

Before you submit anything in writing to anyone else on this subject and before you communicate the enclosed information to anyone we would like an opportunity to make suggestions prior to each time you do so. This is also of great importance because you are a potential nominee for the ANS Council which has published articles by both Hodder and Buttrey. There is no effort to deter or prevent you from expressing yourself.

Please ask for anything else you may need from us.

Sincerely,

Eric P. Newman

7/8/00 In Cale Springs at ANA Summer Seminar

Edwin S. Vallier (Jim) works for Don Kagin, lives in Lake Tahoe resident says Paul Franklin ~~just~~ died, has one son in San Fran and who is crippled by motorcycle accident. Another son elsewhere. Paul had exhibited bars in a family reunion at Oct 1999 coin show in Reno or Carson City. Vallier wrote, next of Brasher Bullion — knows promoted well and knew Ronnie Carroll long ago.

Subj:	**Re: (no subject)**
Date:	05/28/2002 4:26:33 PM Central Daylight Time
From:	[redacted]
To:	

Hi Eric,

Sorry, but I don't have any Criswell books in stock, so go ahead and see if you can get the Kolbe lot.

Thank you for your concern about my personal situation. That is being resolved and things should smooth out shortly. I'll also get something to you this week-hopefully!

George Fuld has graciously sent photocopies of his correspondence regarding the Franklin Hoard and Lilly discussions from the 1960's. I had asked him if he would consider it, and he was very quick to help me with my research material. I haven't told him about Painter yet, and his copy (Wormser's) has the name of the Arizona banker deleted as well.

I've just finished up a 10 page article about the 1827/3/2 quarter pedigrees for Bowers. It's like untangling fishing line. Maybe he will print it before the end of the year.

Take care. Stay well.

Regards,
Karl

Subj: **Re: (no subject)**
Date: 2/9/2003 7:16:07 PM Central Standard Time
From: [redacted]
To:
Sent from the Internet (Details)

Thanks Eric:

The Fernand David collection was auctioned by J. Schulman on March 11, 1930. There is no indication of its previous pedigree. What is interesting is that it is listed as a Shultz piece, despite the fact the coin is inscribed Shults. A nice "catch" for someone in the Netherlands.

It this piece was not made, and salted in a European sale by Nagy, it must have been made by Paul's older relative, C. Wyllys Franklin.

Are you sure that the Smithsonian has no accession info on the "16" revaluation stamp? They said they had no record of the Ryder 40, but I looked into their files and found that they actually did. It was given to them as part of a lot of miscellaneous British counterfeits and other oddities that was donated by Mendel Petersen (?sp), a navy man and member of the Washington coin club, who did occasional volunteer work at the Smithsonian for many years. Lots are not always individually broken down in Smithsonian accession records, and they are the ideal place to "salt" material.

It may be possible to learn where the "16" piece came from, but it will probably be a dead end trail. We have never discussed these pieces but I have always been weary of them, mostly because of Swoger's hyper insistence that they be listed in the Red Book. (Of course I resisted). I would like to hear more of what you know about these curious pieces.

Did I mention that I am going to replace the picture of the Bowie $5 in the Red Book with a picture of the $1 pattern? I think I can get away with that without "the old boys club" suing the publisher for harming the value of their pieces. Hopefully, later I can eliminate any mention of the $5 piece altogether.

Ken

At 03:27 PM 2/9/2003 -0500, you wrote:

> Ken: Thank you for the copies of communications.
> Perhaps I told you previously that at the time of the Chicago convention at which the $20 USAOG hearing was begun I believe I learned that a joke was played on Kosoff as to the Schultz overstrike on the Mexican peso. The coin was borrowed from Kosoff prior thereto and an electro was made from it. The electro instead of the original was returned to Kosoff to see if he knew the difference. He didn't. Later he was told about the "joke" and the two pieces were exchanged. Whether Nagy made the original depends on when the original was first discovered. Do you know whether the Davis collection was its first appearance?
> Since you are concerned about the 10 reales coin of Santo Domingo I have some new unanswered problems about the 16 revaluation counterstamp which Swoger once investigated about 8 years ago. I understand that Smithsonian has one with no accession data. This reminds me of the Ryder 40 Vermont which showed up in Smithsonian and had no accession record. This also reminds me of the official statements about the 1804 dollar being as good as the one in the MInt Collection. Methinks that the technique of salting a gold mine sample may have been applied to the Smithsonian collection as a means to help authenticate other pieces owned on the putside. Have we ever talked about this? Eric

A.C Nygren Auction by Henry Chapman
4|29|24

Lot 58 #10 Baldwin horseman die cut by Kunes. "recent issue" #old plated lead of Illustrated

Lot 59 #10 Baldwin horseman plain lead

Lot 85 Mass + Calif #5 in silver